

AUKUS Pact in the Perspective of Security Dilemma



Eryn Sobarini¹, Deni Dadang Ahmad Rajab², Surryanto Djoko Waluyo³

^{1,2,3}Indonesia Defense University

ABSTRACT: Indo-Pacific is one of strategic region with complex political interest because of huge area and many involved country including major countries such as China and United States. The increase of China's power in the region caused security dilemma for other countries. United States is one of major power that feels threatened with the rise of China. United States have a lot of cooperation with other major countries and the newest one is trilateral cooperation with Australia and United Kingdom in AUKUS Pact. AUKUS Pact caused a different reaction from countries in Indo-Pacific region. In the perspective of security dilemma, AUKUS Pact is one of United States's security dilemma because of the rise of China. The AUKUS Pact point is help Australia to have a nuclear submarines. AUKUS Pact is not an arms race but at some point AUKUS Pact can escalated arms race in Indo-Pacific region.

KEYWORDS: Indo-Pacific, AUKUS Pact, Security Dilemma, China, United States

INTRODUCTION

The dynamics of Asia Pacific region brings up a concept called Indo-Pacific. This region have a complex political interest because of a huge area and many involved country in this region. Indo-Pacific not only involves developing countries which are located in this region, but involves superpower countries such as United States and China. United States considering the rise of China as a new super power in the international relation as a threat and China considering United States as a threat because United States is one of the most influential superpower in the international relation. Indo-Pacific is one of strategic region so these two countries are trying to increases their influence in this region. The United States and China launched their interests and then determine the political dynamics in the region through their strategic policies aimed to not only maintaining but also expanding their influence to countries in the Indo-Pacific region (Sari & Delanova, 2021, p. 2).

Indo-Pacific increasingly emerging since Washington launched thir foreign policy towards Asia in November 2017 in President Donald Trump's first visit to Asia with "a Free and Open Indo Pacific". This concept is a respond by United States to the rise of China's economic and military power. United States keep developing Indo-Pasific concept and gather the power of major countries in the region. At first, United States pushed for a common views between the four great powers including United States, Australia, India, and Japan through Quadrilateral Security Dialogue.

In September 2021, United States announced their newest alliance with Australia and United Kingdom. These countries build a trilateral cooperation called AUKUS Pact. AUKUS Pact consist a cooperation to help Australia have a nuclear subamarines. United States, United Kingdom, and Australia claimed this cooperation is aimed to face the challenges of the 21st century. But the rising of China in this region raise a suspicions that AUKUS Pact was aimed to against China. The presence of the AUKUS Pact has caused an escalation in the Indo-Pacific. There are contraversion between countries. Indo-Pacific is a region with nuclear proliferation and AUKUS Pact have a cooperation point about nuclear submarines for Australia. The existence of AUKUS Pact will affect security dynamic in Indo-Pacific region. Every country have a different reaction about the AUKUS Pact and in the perspective of security dilemma, this different reactions can lead Indo-Pacific region into the arms race. The AUKUS Pact involved many countries including major countries and ASEAN as one of influential regional organization in this region. This study will explain the AUKUS Pact in the perspective of security dilemma.

THEORY AND CONCEPT

This research will using security dilemma and arms race as a theoretical basis. According to John Herz, anarchic international envirotnment create mutual fear between countries because of misunderstanding (Sulistyo, 2014, p. 167). Based on that condition, security is top priority for the countries and each country will try to reach and strengthen their security by increasing their military power. The increase of country's military strength become a sensitive things because it can caused security dilemma for other country. Security dilemma is one concept ini realism. Security dilemma caused two major things. First, efforts to increase the military strength of a country tend to always be interpreted as a means of developing offensive power by other countries, and second, it is difficult to distinguish between defensive forces and offensive forces (Shiddiqy, 2019, p. 67). Security dilemma is a condition that

AUKUS Pact in the Perspective of Security Dilemma

caused country increase their power by create an alliance with other countries because their worries about their security. According to John H. Herz, security dilemma is a structural idea that is attempted by a country to maintain its security regardless of its intentions, the desire to attack other countries, especially the surrounding countries because for this country, its actions are defensive actions but for other countries, this action is a threat.

Security Dilemma is one of the concepts in realism theory that arises as a result of actions from a country to improve the security of his country, but on other side this causes a reaction from other countries who also want to improve their security, which in turn causes a decrease of security in the first country. The security dilemma also defined as an action and reaction between several countries, where one of the countries makes an increase in security but the increase is considered to weaken the security of other countries (Fariani & Sholeh, 2020, p. 122). This can happen because a country feels threatened by the power possessed by another country so it tries to increase its weapons and defenses that end in a situation where countries are competing to produce weapons (Shiddiqy, 2019, p. 71). If a countries increase their military power it will cause suspicion from other countries that can lead to an arms race in the world. In the concept of international relations, the security dilemma is present as a concept that aimed to analyze and explain what is happening between countries and their persistences in increasing their security. A country will feel threatened with other country's military increasing and make a move to make sure about their security. In the concept of security dilemma, those countries will compete to improve their military powers. In order to protect themselves, states seek to control, or at least to neutralize, areas on their border (Jervis, 1978, p. 169).

Security dilemma that these countries have can cause an arms race. According to Buzan, arms race is the implications of nation's military technology development in international relations (Sulistyo, 2014, p. 168). This research is also using balance of power concept that relate with balance strength in terms of quantity possession of conventional weapons (non-nuclear) in Indo-Pacific Region. This research will use qualitative studies to analyze AUKUS Pact in the perspective of security dilemma. This research will use secondary data sources such as books, journals, and internet sites and for data analysis, this research will using content analysis method. Content analysis is a method research that is an in-depth discussion of the content of an information written. In this study, researcher will conduct content analysis from various sources of data and articles that relevant to AUKUS Pact in Indo-Pacific region.

INDO PACIFIC REGION

After the Cold War, international order changed into issues that related to high politics. These days, there is a big change in the constellation of world security politics that inclined to the east, especially to Indo-Pacific region. Until now, Indo-Pacific still did not have a clear territorial boundaries but ASEAN have a view that Indo-Pacific is a region includes Indian Ocean and Pacific Ocean. Indo-Pacific includes huge area start from Indian, west and middle part of Pacific Ocean with its countries including east coast countries such as Africa, South Asia, East Asia, Southeast Asia, Australia, and United States (Herindrasti, 2019, p. 45). In the concept of geopolitics, the term Indo-Pacific was first used by German geopolitican, Karl Haushover in 1920 in his article entitled "Indopasifizhen Raum". Since that, IndoPasific term was used in economic or political security to point area in between Indian Ocean and Pacific Ocean. Since 2010, Indo-Pacific is a discussion between policy makers, analysts, or academics.

In Indo-Pacific region, many state actors involved and have a significant influence for regional and global politics. One of them is China, whose increasing their influences in Asia. China have a economic and military improvement in the region which can become a opportunities or threats for the other countries. China's activities have attracted the attention of many countries, especially countries with direct interests in the region as well as other major countries. Social economic and geopolitical in Indo-Pacific region will affect the stability and security of the region.

AUKUS PACT

The rise of China in Indo-Pacific region will influence other countries, especially major countries like United States. As a super power, United States will increase their power in Indo-Pacific since Indo-Pacific is the one of strategic region. Other than that, Australia is starting their external political in Indo-Pacific. The increase of China activity is a threat for other major countries in international relation. In balancing China's strength in Indo-Pacific, United States develop an alliance with other countries. At first, United States developed Quadrilateral with Australia, Japan, and India. The signing of the AUKUS Pact confirms Australia's position in this world by favoring the United States over China.

These countries claimed that AUKUS Pact is aimed to face the challenges of the 21st century and not directly said this AUKUS Pact is aimed to face China's activity in IndoPacific. But these countries showed their worries about regional security because significant increase of strength in the region. AUKUS Pact agreed about several things such as technology and information sharing in various aspects including intelligent, quantum technology, and cruise missile purchase. Beside that, AUKUS Pact focused on developing nuclear submarines for Australian Navy. This makes Australia as the 7th country to have nuclear submarines in the world. According to Guy Boekenstein of Australia's Asia Society research institute, this Pact shows that these three countries have drawn a line in order to counter China's aggressive moves (BBC News, 2021).

AUKUS Pact in the Perspective of Security Dilemma

AUKUS PACT IN THE PERSPECTIVE OF SECURITY DILEMMA

The emergence of AUKUS security community between Australia, United Kingdom, and United States will provide dynamics in security stability in the Indo-Pacific region. These three countries claimed that AUKUS Pact is an efforts to ensure peace and enhance stability in the IndoPacific region. Some defense analysts hope that this new alliance will help other countries to believe in United States and their commitment to countriea in a geopolitical context. Australia, United Kingdom, and United States also claimed that this AUKUS Pact is aimed to face threats in the 21st century.

These three countries did not explicitly state that the AUKUS Pact was here to against China. However, it can be seen that AUKUS Pact is one of the efforts made to balance the power of China. AUKUS Pact is one of the United States's strategy to maintain their hegemony by supporting strong countries in the region to stem the rise of China's influence in the international order, especially in the IndoPacific as the one of strategic region in the world. AUKUS

Pact focused on providing nuclear submarine assistance to Australia, and it will create a security dilemma where other rival countries will present or adding similar fleets that are more sophisticated and can lead to an arms race.

In the perspective of the security dilemma, an increase in security is carried out by a country when it feels threatened by an increase in the military owned by another country. The emergence of China as a new power in Asia poses a security dilemma for other countries, especially the United States as the old hegemony in the international relation. The United States made various efforts to strengthen its influence in the Indo-Pacific region. AUKUS Pact is a manifestation of the security dilemma that the United States has as one of the major countries with interests and influence in the Indo-Pacific region. The rise of China has the impact of the emergence of a security dilemma in the Indo-Pacific region. This is in line with the action-reaction model where the state will strengthen its weapons because of the threat it will receive from other countries (Rachmat, 2017, p. 2). This is happen between United States and China where each country feels a security threats with the increase in the military of other countries, especially from rival countries.

The AUKUS Pact caused different reactions from each country. First one is from ASEAN as one of the influential regional organization in the Indo-Pacific region. The Russian Foreign Minister, Sergey Lavrov, expressed his opinion that the various partnerships undertaken by the United States are aimed at undrmining the longstanding format of cooperation in the Indo-Pacific region (Erina, 2021). The presence of AUKUS Pact is a temptation for ASEAN solidarity as one of the most influential regional organizations in the Indo-Pacific region. ASEAN is in the midst of rivalry between major countries which causes ASEAN to be in a difficult position. As of October 2021, ASEAN has yet to issue an official statement regarding the AUKUS Pact eventhough this Pact has a significant political impact in the Indo-Pacific region. This ASEAN silence is suspected its bcause ASEAN members have different views on the AUKUS Pact. Some ASEAN countries support this AUKUS Pact and some countries did not. The relationship between ASEAN member countries and China affects how they behave towards AUKUS Policy.

Philippines is one of the countries that involved in South China Sea dispute. So far, Philippines supporting AUKUS Pact by considering their national interest in the South China Sea. Historical factors between Philippines with United States caused Philipinnes give their support to the AUKUS Pact. Philippines support the alliance of those three countries and expecting this AUKUS Pact can maintain the balance of power in the Indo-Pacific region. The Philippines views this alliance as meant to respond to China's growing power. The Philippine Foreign Ministry stated that increasing the ability of close foreign allies to project power should restore and maintain the balance rather than destabilize it (VOI ID, 2021).

Besides the Philippines, Vietnam also supports the presence of the AUKUS Pact as a counterweight to China's power in the Indo-Pacific region because of their own national interests. Likewise with Singapore, Prime Minister Lee Hsien Loong stated that he hoped the AUKUS Pact would "constructively contribute to regional peace and stability and also complement the regional architecture. Meanwhile, Indonesia and Malaysia expressed their concerns that the AUKUS Pact would only accelerate the arms race in the region and could lead to instabilities of regional security and peace. Indonesian foreign minister, Retno Marsudi, stated in a wider context outside Southeast Asia, the Indo Pacific, Indonesia sees and is concerned about rising tensions between the major powers in Asia Society. Malaysia itself said that AUKUS Pact could stimulate more aggressive actions from countries that have conflicts of interest in the Indo-Pacific region. The difference on attitudes between ASEAN countries does not represent ASEAN's attitude as an organization but this can affect the centrality and neutrality of ASEAN in Indo-Pacific region. Besides, ASEAN countries also have their own national interest to achieve so its hard for ASEAN to call out their collective attitudes whereas it is important to ASEAN to call out their collective attitudes before this organization divided by the major countries. ASEAN is expected to be an independent and effective regional stabilizer in maintaining security stability in the region. It can be said that the AUKUS Pact is not an arm race, but the AUKUS Pact could be a trigger for the escalation of the arms race in the Indo-Pacific region. This will increase tensions in the Indo-Pacific region which can lead to open conflicts. If there is an open conflict between China and Australia, ASEAN countries which are geographically located between these two countries will be affected. ASEAN itself is in a nuclear-free position, in accordance with the provisions of the Bangkok Treaty ini 1955. However, one of the focuses in the AUKUS Pact is the assistance of nuclear submarines for Australia which could cause Southeast Asia is under nuclear siege as a impact of the AUKUS Pact. AUKUS Pact itself its not just about nuclear submarines. There are 11 agreements in that Pact such as cyber

AUKUS Pact in the Perspective of Security Dilemma

cooperation, space cooperation, defense industry, surveillance and intelligent, and many more. We should more worry about it (Bakrie, 2021)

In addition, the rejection also came from an ally of the United States, France. Because of the AUKUS Pact, France's contract with Australia that related to the procurement of 14 diesel-electric submarines. France admitted that they were very disappointed with the actions of Australia as their partner country and consider it as a betrayal because Australia hid the AUKUS Pact from France where Australia should have consulted until France withdrew its ambassadors from the United States and Australia. The European Union itself is allegedly providing support to France. It shows that the AUKUS Pact is increasing the complexity of the conflicts of interest between major countries in the Indo-Pacific region. Meanwhile, China considers the AUKUS Pact as an irresponsible act that can threaten regional stability. Chinese Foreign Ministry spokesman Zhao Lijian said that the AUKUS Pact severely damaged regional peace and stability and also intensified the arms race in the Indo-Pacific region. The point of the AUKUS agreement on nuclear submarines for Australia is seen as a violation of Australia's commitment to nuclear non-proliferation. Australia itself through Prime Minister Morrison stated that Australia will continue to maintain its obligations under the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty.

In the perspective of security dilemma, military enhancement is carried out by a country will lead to the desire of other countries to increase their military strength as well and can lead to an arms race. The presence of the AUKUS Pact in the strategic Indo-Pacific region can be said to be a form of Australia, United Kingdom, and United States's security dilemma against the rise of China. Currently, the AUKUS Pact can not be considered as an arms race, but the AUKUS Pact can increase tensions in the Indo-Pacific region. In reflecting on this regional trend, many observers are suggesting that an arms race is taking place in the Asia Pacific and several other countries show a security dilemma as the driving force of this competition (Fariani & Sholeh, 2020, p. 121).

Indonesian Foreign Minister stated that Indonesia accepting Australia's commitments to respect the NPT, nonproliferation principles, and international law but the things that we all don't want is the possibility of increasing arms race and power projection in the region, which obviously will threaten the regional security stability (Haryono, 2021). According to the Chief of Staff of the Air Force of the Republic of Indonesia, Marshal Fadjar Prasetyo, the AUKUS Trilateral Security Pact is feared to increase military tension and could encourage a nuclear arms race in the region (Kompas, 2021). The presence of the AUKUS Pact which is seen as a security dilemma against China will create a security dilemma for other countries in the region and will continue to allow an arms race to occur in the region. Rivalry between the two parties who have this security dilemma can also cause security instability in the region. Since the end of the Cold War, scholars and policymakers have widely regarded the Asia Pacific as a "ripe for rivalry" and risked increasing military competition (Fariani & Sholeh, 2020, p. 121).

In order to protect themselves, states seek to control, or at least to neutralize, areas on their border (Jervis, 1978, p. 169). Indo-Pacific region is directly bordered with Southeast Asian countries-known as ASEAN members. Geopolitical situation in Indo-Pacific region will affect ASEAN so ASEAN need to protect themselves or at least neutralize the Indo-Pacific region. To face the AUKUS Pact, ASEAN as one of influential regional organization in Indo-Pacific region need to strengthen their power in this region. The existence of AUKUS Pact and its controversy can lead to conflict and the arms race especially to those who are disagree with the AUKUS Pact. They will do anything to balance the AUKUS and the power projection between countries in this region will increased. Thus, ASEAN needs to keep their centrality in this region and show their collective attitude. ASEAN needs to strengthen the evolution of regional architecture to maintain peace, security, and stability in the region. ASEAN itself has established themselves as a unifier of East Asia and Asia Pacific so that ASEAN is a hope for the Indo-Pacific region as a neutral and independent regional stabilizer.

CONCLUSION

AUKUS Pact is a challenge that must be faced by countries in the Indo-Pacific region where the AUKUS Pact could provides many geopolitical changes and issues in the Indo-Pacific region. There are many controversies related to the AUKUS Pact that created the potential for conflict to break out in the Indo-Pacific region because countries that against the AUKUS Pact will do various things to balance the AUKUS Pact so that power competition in this region will increase. Basically, the AUKUS Pact is not a form of arms race, but can be regarded as a form of security dilemma for these three countries. The AUKUS Pact can increase military tensions in the region which can lead to an arms race in the region. This can lead to security instability in the region. To face this situation, important to ASEAN to keep ASEAN centrality and show their collective attitude. ASEAN needs to strengthen the evolution of regional architecture to maintain peace, security, and stability in the region. ASEAN itself has established their self as a unifier of East Asia and Asia Pacific so that ASEAN is a hope for the Indo-Pacific region as a neutral and independent regional stabilizer.

REFERENCES

- 1) Bakrie, C. R. (2021, December 3). Indonesia Defense Diplomacy in Sulu-Celebes Sea. (E. Sobarini, Interviewer) Bogor.
- 2) BBC News. (2021, September 17). *Aukus: Mengapa Pakta Pertahanan Inggris, AS, Australia Prioritaskan Pembuatan Kapal Selam untuk Tangkal China di Indo Pasifik*. Retrieved October 18, 2021, from <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/dunia-58592794>

AUKUS Pact in the Perspective of Security Dilemma

- 3) Erina, R. (2021, October 4). *Diplomat Top Rusia: AUKUS dan QUAD Pimpinan AS adalah Upaya Merusak Kerja Sama ASEAN*. Retrieved October 15, 2021, from <https://dunia.rmol.id/read/2021/10/04/506790/diplomattop-rusia-aukus-dan-quad-pimpinan-as-adalah-upaya-merusak-kerja-sama-asean>
- 4) Fariani, M., & Sholeh, B. (2020). China's Military Increase: A Security Dilemma In Asia Pacific. *Mandala: Jurnal Hubungan Internasional Volume 3 No 2 Juli-Desember 2020*, 120-133.
- 5) Haryono, W. (2021, September 22). *Tanggapi AUKUS, Menlu Ingatkan Kembali Terkait Ancaman Perlombaan Senjata*. Retrieved November 13, 2021, from <https://www.medcom.id/internasional/eropaamerika/3NO9wy0k-tanggapi-aukus-menlu-ingatkan-kembali-terkait-ancaman-perlombaan-senjata>
- 6) Herindrasti, V. S. (2019). Fenomena Indo-Pasifik dan Diplomasi Indonesia. *Jurnal Asia Pacific Studies Volume 3 Number 1 January-June 2019*, 44-51.
- 7) Jervis, R. (1978). *Cooperation Under the Security Dilemma*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press .
- 8) Kompas. (2021, October 25). *KSAU: AUKUS Dapat Tingkatkan Ketegangan Militer dan Lomba Senjata Nuklir di Kawasan*. Retrieved November 8, 2021, from <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2021/10/25/13273021/ksauaukus-dapat-tingkatkan-ketegangan-militer-dan-lomba-senjata-nuklir-di>
- 9) Rachmat, A. N. (2017). Security Dilemma dalam Dinamika Hubungan Bilateral China dan Jepang. *Interdependence Jurnal Hubungan Internasional Volume 5 No 1 Januari-April 2017*, 1-9.
- 10) Sari, S., & Delanova, M. O. (2021). Strategi Kebijakan Luar Negeri Indonesia dalam Meningkatkan Daya Tawar di Kawasan Indo-Pasifik. *Jurnal Dinamika Global Volume 6 No 1 Tahun 2021*.
- 11) Shiddiqy, M. A. (2019). Security Dilemma and Arms Race in Southeast Asian Region Post-Cold War Era. *Journal of Diplomacy and International Studies Volume 2 No 1*, 66-79.
- 12) Sonta, A. (2016). Regions and Power: The Structures of International Security Book Review. *Jurnal Keamanan Nasional Vol II No 1 Tahun 2016*.
- 13) Sulistyono, I. (2014). Kebijakan Pertahanan Indonesia 1998-2010 dalam Merespon Dinamika Lingkungan Strategis di Asia Tenggara. *Andalas Journal of International Studies/Vol 3 No 2 November Tahun 2014*, 165-191.
- 14) VOI ID. (2021, September 24). *Beda Negara ASEAN Sikapi Kapal Selam Nuklir, Australia Sebut Hormati Perjanjian Non-proliferasi Nuklir*. Retrieved October 25, 2021, from <https://voi.id/berita/88102/beda-negara-aseansikapi-kapal-selam-nuklir-australia-sebut-hormati-perjanjian-non-proliferasi-nuklir>