

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time



PhD. Tran Minh Duc
Thu Dau Mot University

ABSTRACT: Religion is a part of the spiritual life of society, a superstructure phenomenon moving and changing strongly at all times along with the socio-economic development of any country. In recent times, the religion in Vietnam has had a great influence on traditional customs and practices in both directions: positive and negative. On the one hand, it contributes to restoring many good traditional customs and practices of the nation, contributing to changing the lifestyle and behavior of a part of the people; On the other hand, the religion revives many outdated depraved customs and practices, deforming and fading some traditional customs and practices. These impacts have been posing many problems to be resolved for Vietnam in the process of building and developing the country in the new era. Vietnam has been being in the process of increasingly deepening international integration, which is expected to continue to cause many difficulties and obstacles for State management of religion, because religious activities are often associated with cultural activities. Cultural diversity leads to religious diversity.

KEYWORDS: people, religion, believer, culture, Vietnam

I. INTRODUCTION

Vietnam is a country of many religions with about 26 million believers, 55,000 dignitaries, over 130,000 sub-dignitaries, and nearly 28,000 worship facilities (Government Committee for Religious Affairs, 2019). So far, the State of Vietnam has recognized legal status for 16 religions, 36 religious organizations and 1 religious Dharma gate. Buddhism religion is the religion of the largest number of believers with nearly 14 million believers, over 30,000 dignitaries, nearly 68,000 sub-dignitaries, nearly 18,000 worship facilities and 40 training institutions spreading across the country; Catholicism religion ranks second in number of believers with about 7 million believers, over 4,000 priests, 44 bishops, 1 cardinal, over 16,000 monks and over 5,500 churches, cathedrals and chapels; Cao Dai religion has about 2.5 million believers; Hoa Hao Buddhism religion has 1.45 million believers; Protestantism religion has over 1.12 million believers; Pure Land Buddhist Association has about 600,000 believers; Islam religion has about 80,000 believers; Hieu Nghia Ta Lon Buddhism religion has about 65,000 believers; Tu An Hieu Nghia religion has about 62,000 believers; Brahmanism religion has about 54,000 believers; Seventh-day Adventist religion has over 16,000 believers; Strange Fragrance from Precious Mountain religion has over 10,000 believers; Minh Su religion has about 10,000 believers; Baha'i religion has about 7,000 believers; Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints has about 1,000 believers; Minh Ly religion – Tam Tong temple has over 1,000 believers (Government Committee for Religious Affairs, 2019);

In the context of vibrant religious activities, in addition to positive impacts, religious changes in Vietnam also have a significant negative impact on the customs and practices of Vietnamese people, leaving behind negative consequences for national culture. Many outdated depraved customs and practices also have the opportunity to strongly revive. Religious activities in some places have been being transformed into negative activities, which have a very negative impact on social life. Funeral rituals for some people are cumbersome and expensive. In particular, in the trend of new religious phenomena, anti-cultural and inhumane religious phenomena appear having negative impacts on culture, ethics, customs and traditions of the nation. The above-mentioned reality has been posing many problems of Vietnam, which is how to promote good and beautiful features of religion for the process of building an advanced Vietnamese culture with richness in national identity, and to limit its negative impacts on the development of the country in the new era.

II. RELATIONSHIP OF RELIGION, CULTURE AND PEOPLE IN CURRENT VIETNAMESE SOCIETY

2.1. Relationship of religion and culture

Religion is a part of culture, an element of culture, and has impacts on culture in many situations: promotion, interaction, contradiction – conflict, mutual exclusion. If the power of religion to penetrate culture is stronger than the ability of culture to

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time

“react”, then the culture may be damaged, fractured, assimilated and lose its identity. On the contrary, if the culture “frames” and rejects the religion, then that culture becomes conservative. This reality has happened in Vietnam when Vietnamese people accepted foreign religions, creating states of cultural security: (1) Cultural identity is at risk of being eroded, disappeared and assimilated; (2) Cultural self-defense against something new and strange to the point of not accepting religion, creating conflict; (3) Each side adjusts itself to accept each other, while religious security and cultural security are guaranteed. The three foregoing religious states affecting cultural security all happened when the religions penetrated Vietnam.

In the case of Catholicism, in the beginning, when it was first introduced into Vietnam, Catholicism had a tendency to Catholicize the local culture, bringing with it Western cultural values, and imposing them on Vietnamese cultural values. It immediately encountered major obstacles. With the characteristics of polytheistic religious mental life, Catholicism proved difficult to be compatible and integrated. Belief in polytheism of Vietnamese people was considered superstitious and an obstacle in the development of Catholicism. Catholic teachings straddled the line between “worshiping ancestors” and “worshiping God” and then Catholicism forced Vietnamese people to reject the custom of ancestor worship. Therefore, the culture defended itself against Catholicism, viewing it as one of the risks causing destruction and cultural corruption. Vietnamese people fought against Catholicism as against a risk of cultural insecurity. For a long time afterward, the missionaries had to adjust their missionary methods, learned about the customs and practices of Vietnamese people to evangelize, live with and practice the religion in accordance with the style, habits and needs of Vietnamese people. As a result, Catholicism has found its place in Vietnam cultural life. It has satisfied the shortcomings in the spiritual life of Vietnamese people, creating hope and faith in the gods who can help them have a better life. Catholicism also contributes to enriching the customs, practices and beliefs of Vietnamese people with a theological and philosophical foundation. The custom of worshiping ancestors and midwives for newborns of Kinh people has been reinforced by theological foundation in the Sacrament of Baptism. The ancestral worship ceremony of Vietnamese people with incense, flowers, tea, wine, meat and conjuration to pray for the establishment and communication between the two worlds of the living and the dead has been felt more sacred in the Holy Sacrament with Catholic bread and wine. The wedding ceremony of Vietnamese people which cannot ignore the custom of worshiping ancestors before the bride procession to report to the ancestors who will bless the young couple to be happy until the end of their lives will be made deeper and more disciplined by the Catholic Sacrament of Matrimony.

In the case of Protestantism, it is a religion containing many new elements associated with the development of Western society under capitalism. When introduced to Vietnam with peculiarities of long-standing and traditional customs, practices, beliefs and culture, Protestantism encountered many difficulties in the process of spreading and integrating. However, when Protestantism was introduced to ethnic minority communities in the Central Highlands and Northwest regions, it had encouraging impacts in the creation of new cultural and civilizational features in the customs and practices of the people, changing some outdated habits and customs. Through religious activities, Protestantism has contributed significantly to changing the concepts, lifestyle, habits and customs of the people. Protestantism is also a powerful agent for absorbing new cultural lifestyles. In the past, ethnic minorities in the Central Highlands and Northwest regions, living in high mountainous areas, lived a closed life and had little interaction with the outside world, so they still retained old cultural habits and practices passed down from generation to generation. Among them, many habits and customs are no longer suitable for the current times, but the people do not give them up easily without a strong impact from changes in awareness, ideology, or from approaching new culture. In that context, when Protestantism came to the people, it brought new awareness and ways of thinking. Following the new religious lifestyle, the people have abandoned some old and outdated lifestyle practices. The most typical fact is the reduction of time and economic costs for funeral, wedding, and medical treatment practices. Furthermore, the transition from traditional belief in many different gods to choosing a religion with a single supreme and more powerful god can also be seen as a step forward in the cultural life, religion and beliefs of the people.

In the case of Buddhism, the fusion and influence of Buddhism on customs, beliefs, and even indigenous religions such as Hoa Hao Buddhism, Cao Dai, Strange Fragrance from Precious Mountain, Tu An Hieu Nghia is very clear. In most of the customs and beliefs of Vietnamese people, we see traces of Buddhism (Mother worship, ancestor worship, natural god worship (cloud, rain, thunder, lightning), human deity worship (Saint Tran) to customs of new moon and full moon worship (the 1st and the 15th of lunar month), funeral ceremonies (worship in the 1st week, worship in the 7th week, ...), family deity worship (god of wealth, earth god, ...), customs of vegetarianism, ...). The customs and practices of Vietnamese people have absorbed the rituals and traditions of Buddhism, making customs and rituals richer and more diverse.

Even in the case of Islam being a world religion with the formula “sword – hooves – Quran”, but when it was spread to Vietnam and Southeast Asia, Islam was completely different from other places where Islam invaded by wars of conquest in Western Europe. The spread of Islam into Vietnam by the “peaceful” way, harmonizing with local culture, mixing with beliefs, customs and practices of Cham community has created a variant of Islam, called Bani Islam, imbued with customs and beliefs of Cham people, interacting with Buddhism, Hinduism and Brahmanism.

Thus, the customs and practices of Vietnamese people, after adapting to religions, have absorbed religion, making it newer, richer, and deeper. In the process of such interference, religion and customs will change in two situations: (1) Religion and customs

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time

are both popularized and harmonized with each other. When religion integrates with local culture, it becomes more popular and easily penetrates the lives of the people, while customs change in the direction of “cultural acculturation”, integrating with external factors to become newer, richer, and present in a new religious space. However, when customs are tinged with the sacred color of religion, they will gain more power and become mystical, thereby oppressing and binding people in anxiety by an “invisible” force. As religion becomes customary and popularized, it will become permissive, lowering “heaven”. If the “Nirvana” is at the level of the earth so that all sentient beings can easily achieve it, then the doctrine will become superficial, lack purity and be no longer sublime. Sacred spaces, landscapes, and religious rituals are more or less transformed. (2) Conflicts may occur when religions, customs and beliefs are different, even opposing each other. The vast majority of religions worship one god, promote morality and promise a good environment for people to practice to become Saints, Gods and Buddha, while beliefs of worshiping polytheism, pantheism, good spirits, evil spirits, ..., with some rituals such as offering food to the dead, making sacrifices, ... are considered depraved customs and superstitions. The conflicts arise leading to the religion using all means (including coercion) to penetrate, causing the national culture to be fractured and eroded. Some ethnically specific practices have been eliminated due to mandatory regulations of religious doctrine. For example, Protestantism and Catholicism have regulations that are not compatible with Vietnamese customs and practices, forcing the people to give up some customs left by their ancestors. In the past, the people often believed in many gods and placed them in solemn places in the house or inviolable common space of the village or the community to worship (communal houses, temples, shrines, palaces, ...), but when following religions, they were not allowed to worship any idol other than the God. Sacred spaces, sacred objects and sacred stories began to gradually lose their meaning and role. The long-standing custom of worshiping ancestors was also abolished. Whether people comes to the God or the Creator voluntarily or by enticement, seduction or threatening, the sense of respect for ancestors is disturbed and replaced by respect for another invisible force. Or, in the past, gongs were sacred objects, with gods residing in them. “The sound of gongs is the one connecting real human life with sacred world of gods” (Dinh Van Hanh, 2010), but after Protestantism penetrated the ethnic minority communities in the Central Highlands, with the concept of one god, the sound of gongs also gradually lost their sacred meaning. The spiritual purpose of gongs is no longer the same as the tradition. The sound of gongs in the Protestant community is a place of prayer, containing the meaning of relationship between the people and the God. Thus, the traditional cultural and festival structure has changed. That could be a new gong cultural space next to the traditional gong cultural space of the Central Highlands – a cultural heritage of humanity, ...” (Dinh Van Hanh, 2010). In addition, the traditional cultural and festival activities of ethnic minorities such as Buffalo Stabbing Festival, New Rice Festival, and New Year Festival are also gradually narrowed and lose their function of uniting the community due to the different concepts between religious people and non-religious people.

In the Northwest, there is a phenomenon of religious people refusing to participate in community cultural activities. Among people as Protestant have abandoned or disregarded traditional cultural values, not participating in cultural and religious activities organized by their clans. In the Central Highlands, a group of Protestant destroyed gongs and jars, and announced that they would give up the customs of drinking stem wine, Xoang dance, gong performance, singing folk songs, ... The matriarchy of some ethnic groups in the Central Highlands and the traditional practices of the matriarchal family are also gradually changed. The religious people no longer believe in the traditional customs and spiritual rituals.

The pattern of accepting religions of Vietnamese people comes from needs, interests and aspirations. They often consider whether the religions they follow are compatible with their customs or not. In that process of access and integration, both religion and custom have new faces. Religion brings new nuances for customs and practices, creating a mix and combination between old culture and new culture, between tradition and modernity, between native and foreign, leading to a process of restructuring customs and practices and reconfiguring the spiritual production methods of Vietnamese people. In general, religion and culture, in order to survive and develop, should not only preserve their core values but also constantly change, adapt and harmonize with others. The reality shows that the decisive factor for success in the cultural interference process is the sufficient harmony between “familiar” and “strange” elements. The priest Léopold Michel Cadière (1869 – 1955), in his research on the religious life of Vietnamese people, commented: “Any theories or religions helping Vietnamese people satisfy their spiritual and knowledge needs and achieve the purpose of survival and development are all accepted, but anything contradicting or conflicting with their habits, customs, or practices cannot pass through the “village gate””. In accordance with the theory of some American sociologists, one of the factors creating the attraction of religion is because certain cultural differences create curiosity and attraction, causing people to accept to give up a part of their existing culture to follow the religion, but not forcing them to accept to give up too much of their existing culture. A religion being too different and strange and forcing the believers to sacrifice and give up too much of their culture will often find it very difficult to succeed.

2.2. Relationship between religion and people

In recent times, many scholars have mentioned human security as an emphasis of national security policy. The origin of human security appeared in the declaration of the President of the United States of America – Franklin Roosevelt in 1941. In this speech, F. Roosevelt affirmed that people anywhere in the world have basic freedoms such as: freedom of speech, freedom of religion, freedom from fear, freedom from poverty (Lombardi, Clark B. and Wellman, James, 2012). These are the basic premises

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time

for human security mentioned in many countries and on many global agendas. In every issue, religion or more specifically – religious security – has a close relationship with human security. This is also clearly shown in the annual report on human development 1994 of the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) which defines human security as the composition of two conditions: safety from threatening by poverty, disease and oppression; and being protected when encountering unusual risks in life, including in the family, at work or in society (Journal of Political Theory, 2017). From the above definition of the UNDP, it can be seen that human security covers almost all economic, political and social issues. The concept of human security reflects the needs for protecting specific individuals and communities from threats mainly originating from their surrounding environment, which are non-military threats. Human security assurance is, in essence, also corresponding human right assurance. On the contrary, human right protection and promotion is also aimed at realizing and ensuring seven forms of human security. In addition, both human security and human rights aim to promote democratic principles and institutional development in societies as conditions for sustainable security and human right assurance. In consideration of religious security, we can see the influence of religious security on personal security and community security assurance.

In Vietnam, the issues related to human security have been considered in recent times. In particular, the issue of religious security assurance has been closely linked to the human security. It is no coincidence that, in areas where the religious security is guaranteed, the issues of human development receive more attention. In many areas, when new religious phenomena appeared, the issues of humanity and human development became challenges for the whole community. When Protestantism spread to ethnic minority areas (for example, Hmong area), a part of the population changed their customs and beliefs to follow, along with a series of other social and human problems arising. The religion may also have positive impacts on the human security such as changing the lifestyle of the people in a more progressive direction: dispelling magic; people become wiser and more rational; becoming more aware of human rights, economic rights, political rights and other social rights. However, the religion also has a significant negative impact on personal life, creating chaos in the minds of the people, creating gaps in the choice between the new and the hold, creating confusion in resolving their cultural, economic and interest conflicts. In short, the impact of religious security on political, economic, cultural and human aspects has been an issue of research interest in many countries in recent times.

III. SOME ISSUES THAT VIETNAM HAS BEEN FACING WITH RELIGIOUS TRENDS IN THE COMING TIME

3.1. Issues of religious diversity and intertwining

Since 1975 alone, in Vietnam the number of religious organizations recognized or licensed for operation towards recognition by the State has increased 7 times. In 1999, there were only 6 organizations of 6 religions with about 14.7 million believers. By 2011, there were 34 organizations of 13 religions. In 2020, there were 41 organizations and Dharma gates of 16 religions granted operating registration by the State (Ministry of Home Affairs, 2020). There are also more than 100 new religious phenomena having not been licensed or recognized by the State to be organizations but are still operating. The trend of religious intertwining is manifested in the objects of worship. In Buddhism, the main object is to worship Buddha; but in some places, there is a combination of worshipping Buddha (in front), Mother (at back), and deities such as those who have contributed to the village and the country or Vietnamese cultural celebrities. In Christianity, the main object is to worship God; but in some places, there is a combination of worshipping God and ancestors. In Cao Dai, it is a complex of the three religions of the same origin (Confucianism – Buddhism – Taoism) combined with the worship of the Creator, the Jade Emperor, considered the soul of the universe giving birth to all things, ... The emergence of many new religious phenomena and religious intertwining is an inevitable trend demonstrating the dynamism of religion. This phenomenon raises many significant problems and challenges: (1) In terms of socio-culture, they represent different schools of faith and lifestyle, emphasizing individual freedom or linking groups, promoting female elements in religion, targeting students, pupils, workers in industrial parks, disadvantaged groups, unemployed people, illiterate people, dissatisfied people, and ethnic minorities; (2) In terms of religion, founders and leaders often create “magical powers” to attract believers. Teachings are mainly borrowed from existing traditional religions, mixing ideas and rituals of many religions, often closely linked to ethnic culture and regional culture. They seek to compete with and replace traditional religions, demanding an equal legal status and wishing to share fairly in the “religious market”, thereby easily leading to conflicts with old religions, weakening the religious harmony that is the tradition of Vietnam inherently.

3.2. Issue of religious conversion

Protestant and Catholic sects have been increasingly expanding their propaganda to ethnic minorities and mountainous and remote areas, leading to the phenomenon of people abandoning traditional customs and beliefs to follow new religions. Whether the people come to the new religion voluntarily or by enticement or seduction, their traditional religious consciousness is still more or less disturbed and replaced by the reverence for a new divine force, leading to the people no longer believing in the traditional gods and not performing the traditional religious rituals. Typically, in the Central Highlands, the Protestant people have broken gongs and jars, announced to give up the customs of drinking stem wine, Xoang dance, gong performance, singing folk songs, ... The matriarchy of some ethnic groups in the Central Highlands and the traditional practices of matriarchal families are also gradually changed: Women no longer play an important role, are not promoted, children are not necessarily born with the surnames of their

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time

mothers, ... The above-mentioned cases show that the conflicts between new religions and traditional customs and practices may lead to disruption and decline of traditional culture. New value systems brought about by religion may not “deviate” in a “downward” direction compared to tradition, but have replaced or added new unprecedented values in the traditional value system. Once the direction of change in culture and customs is not a process that is consciously perceived and actively chosen to form a new and appropriate value system but is a spontaneous process influenced and forced by religion, such direction of change is the direction of “coercive” acculturation. At some point, people will feel inadequate and have to find something else to replace it, leading to the phenomenon of people abandoning religion or changing religion. At that time, not only religious security but also spiritual security, human security and cultural security are not guaranteed.

3.3. Issue of new religious extremism

Currently in Vietnam, in addition to 16 religions with 41 organizations and sects recognized by the State, there are also many new religions imported from abroad into Vietnam such as: Falun Gong – China, Unification Church – United States of America, Om Sai Baba – India, Supreme Master Ching Hai – France, Aum – Japan, ... Besides, many new religious phenomena in the country have formed, developed and attracted believers such as: Act of Gratitude and Benevolence; Thanh Minh for National Love; Way of Heaven and Country of Vietnam; Uncle Ho’s Religion; Special Spirituality; Great Dharma – Doan Trang Monk Group; Supreme Council of Justice; Long Hoa Association, ... The common characteristics of these new religious phenomena are: (1) Beliefs and ways of practicing religion are different from traditional religions, taking religious practice as an intermediary means to find solutions for settlement of cultural crisis and conflicts of ethnic and social interests. (2) Commercializing gods, doing business based on supernatural knowledge, using magical methods to achieve economic goals. (3) Explaining unusual phenomena in the direction of superstition, treating diseases without using drugs, using chants and spells, seeking to compete with and replace traditional religions, disrupting religious harmony, insulting faith in other religions (Tran Van Dinh, 2010). This religious transformation brings great challenges to spiritual security, economic security, religious security, social security and even national security, making it very difficult for State management agencies in charge of religion to intervene in these religions because the Constitution and the Law stipulate the right to freely choose religion of the people.

3.4. Issues of religious secularization and superstition

Previously, religious space was a closed and private space. Currently, religious organizations tend to engage in economic activities to support themselves and attract believers. Religions promote economic activities in many forms such as monastic economics, farm economics producing agricultural products and nutritious food, worshipping services to relieve disasters and misfortunes, telling date and time, ... The presence of religions has gone beyond temples, churches, shrines, ..., and penetrated secular space. In the above context, God, saints, deities, and Buddha, which are inherently sacred, are viewed from a much more realistic perspective than before, causing the purity of religion to be damaged by the strong temptation of economic benefits and competition for prestige and reputation. Such damage causes religion to gradually lose its prestige and role of spiritual stabilization for the people, creating a type of faith that is skewed and sometimes sick. Any unhealthy competition for economic benefits or prestige between religions inevitably leads to jealousy, envy, friction, conflict, and factionalism, causing religious instability and leading to social instability. These are also significant challenges to human security, religious security, and more broadly, national security in Vietnam.

IV. CONCLUSION

The transformation of religious culture in Vietnam in the current period is first of all due to the impact of changes in economic, cultural and social life of the reform process with market economy development and international exchange and integration expansion. On the other hand, such transformation is due to the policy of reforming religious affairs of Vietnam to become more and more open and transparent. At the same time, it is a consequence of recovery and increase in demand for religious spiritual life after many years of suppression by war, currently having conditions to rise and expand when entering the period of innovation and opening. The religious appearance and structure in Vietnam in the future are predicted to be structured in an increasingly diverse direction in both type and pluralism. These changes require Vietnam to have new ways of viewing and perspectives as well as policies and laws to promote the positive aspects and limit the negative aspects of religion in the sustainable development of the country. In order to do so, it is necessary to amend and supplement policies and laws related to religion such as land, culture, education, health ..., to ensure synchronization with religious laws and international conventions that Vietnam engages in. In the long term, it is necessary to build religious laws to ensure religious harmony and social consensus in accordance with the motto that all religious organizations and individuals as well as society are allowed to do what the law does not prohibit, in order to develop the religious resources in the best manner for the sustainable development of the country. On the other hand, the perfection of law on religion must aim to build a socio-religious model in the context of a religiously diverse Vietnamese society. In the immediate future, it is necessary to resolve the issue of new religious phenomenon in the direction that all religions are recognized as non-commercial legal entities when they meet the criteria prescribed by the Law on Belief and Religion and encourage other

Analysis of Relationship between Religion and Vietnamese Culture Today and Prediction of Some Religious Security Trends in the Coming Time

religions to promote traditional cultural values and national identity. At the same time, it is required to resolutely fight to eliminate organizations using religion to sabotage the country or anti-human and anti-cultural phenomena.

REFERENCES

- 1) Human security. (2017). Journal of Political Theory. Visit: <http://lyluanchinhtri.vn/home/index.php/tu-dien-mo/item/%202113-an-ninh-con-nguoi.html>.
- 2) Steering Committee for summarization of Resolution No. 25-NQ/TW on religious affairs. (2017). Report on summarization of 15 years of implementing Resolution No. 25-NQ/TW dated March 12, 2003 by the 9th Party Central Committee on religious affairs.
- 3) Government Committee for Religious Affairs. (2019). Documents of the Conference on implementing tasks in 2019 of the State management of beliefs and religions
- 4) Government Committee for Religious Affairs. (2019). Project on survey of current status of land and worship facility of religious organizations in Vietnam today: Solutions and recommendations.
- 5) Ministry of Home Affairs. (2020). Official Dispatch No. 6955/BNV-TGCP promulgating the list of religious organizations and organizations having been granted certificates of religious operation in Vietnam in recent times (as of December, 2020).
- 6) Dinh Van Hanh. (2010). Cultural space and gong cultural space in the Central Highlands, Journal of Past and Present, Issue No. 370, December, 2010, pp. 22 – 25.
- 7) Lombardi, Clark B. and Wellman, James. (2012) Introduction: Religion and Human Security: An Understudied Relationship in James K. Wellman, Jr. & Clark B. Lombardi, eds.: Religion and Human Security: A Global Perspective, Oxford University Press, pp. 1 – 17. Available at SSRN. Visit: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2639275>
- 8) Tran Van Dinh. (2010). Spiritual words from the Soul of Heaven and the Soul of Country (psychic material – recorded by Mrs. Pham Thi Xuyen), Volume II, Hanoi, pp. 24 – 25.



There is an Open Access article, distributed under the term of the Creative Commons Attribution – Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), which permits remixing, adapting and building upon the work for non-commercial use, provided the original work is properly cited.